



INVESTIGATION REPORT

2nd Oct 2011

SUFFOC Hundred Acre Walk

Event

1. **Executive Summary**

This report relates to the SUFFOC orienteering Level C event held on Sunday 2nd Oct 2011 at Hundred Acre Walks (Daisy Wood). Two of the controls; number 3 and 7 on the Green course, were positioned approximately 50m apart. The overprinting of the course on the map (which included the control circle and its associated sequence number) was such that the numbers of the controls ended up adjacent to the wrong circle which caused varying degrees of confusion to the competitors on the course.

A complaint was raised by one of the competitors, Peter Waldron, who was disqualified as he had punched out of sequence. He thought that the results of other competitors had been changed whereas his had not the implication being that he and two other named competitors should be reinstated. The complaint has been investigated by the Organiser for the event (Louise Walker SUFFOC) in accordance with the BOF Rules of Orienteering. *[Rule 9 and Appendix G refer]*.

During the course of the investigation it became apparent that competitors starting after 11:20 were informed of the 'problem' with controls 3 and 7 and it has been suggested that this gave these competitors an advantage over the other earlier starters. Members of the EAOA on-line discussion group (John Ward, Barbara Fothergill, Richard Barker) have suggested that the results should not be used for the East Anglian League. Although no formal complaint was raised in accordance with the BOF rules, the Organiser has extended this investigation to review the results and to determine whether the problem has adversely affected the results to the extent that either

- the affected leg should be voided to put all the competitors on a level playing field or
- the entire race results voided for the purposes of the EA League.

The investigation has found that the problem with the overprinting caused a varying degree of confusion to the competitors ranging from apparently no effect at all with competitors finishing in the top 5 who were not aware of the problem to competitors punching out of sequence even when they were forewarned.

No changes had been made to the other competitor's results with respect to mis-punching

It is a requirement for competitors to punch in sequence therefore the complaint has not been upheld. The competitors shall not be reinstated.

Voiding the affected leg 2 to 3 would have no effect on the relative positions of the top 5 finishers of the overall competition nor would it affect the relative positions of the finishers by age group. The published final results (with all legs included) stand and they shall be used for the EAL.

2. **Key Facts**

2.1. General

2.2. Persons Consulted

Start officials; Clive Wilkinson, John and June Webb, Wilson and Yvonne McLean

Paul Lowe; Download

Simon Peck; Competitor

Tony Biggs; EA League administrator

2.3. E-mail comments received from

Colin West; Controller

Clive Coles: SUFFOC Club Fixtures Secretary

John Ward; Chairman EAOA

Barbara Fothergill; Competitor

Richard Barker: Competitor

2.4. Objectives

This investigation is not to allocate blame but for lessons to be learnt by the event officials and the competitors to avoid a similar situation to occur to ensure that future SUFFOC orienteering events are provided which remain challenging but enjoyable.

2.4.1. To determine the facts

2.4.2. To determine the immediate and root causes

2.4.3. To determine any failures of the organisation, planning or controlling of the event in accordance with the BOF Rules

2.4.4. Whether the complaint should be upheld

2.4.5. To ensure that the final results reflect the correct relative ability of those who competed on the day

3. **Event Summary**

3.1. Description of the event

During the planning of the courses leading up to the event, 'Travellers' illegally occupied an area in Hundred Acre Walks which required a complete re-plan of all of the courses including the relocation of the start to avoid the area which had been occupied by the travellers. The original Green course controls 3 and 7 were separated by a conventional distance, and the OCAD automatic numbering was clear, with the figure 7 due north of the control circle and the 3 due south of its control circle - but this was approx 2.5cm from control 7. In the last week, the Planner moved control 3, after consultation with the Controller, to take it away from woodland that was adversely affected by traveller activity. OCAD automatically moved the control number with the control circle, such that the figure '3' ended touching the control circle for 7 and the figure '7' next to the control circle for 3. The over printing was not checked as the maps were only printed hours prior to the competition. Therefore this 'error' was not picked up prior to the start of the competition by either the Planner or the Controller. The error caused some competitors to think that the circle for control number 7 was number 3. One of the competitors, Simon Peck, reported the problem to the Controller after he had downloaded at 11:12. After due consideration the Controller then asked the Start officials to warn runners on the Green course that numbers 3 and 7 were effectively transposed, but that the lines and circles were correct. This warning was given to all competitors starting after approx 11:20.

3.2. Complaint

Peter Waldron sent the following e-mail on Monday 3rd Oct after the final results were published to SUFFOC club secretary, Clive Wilkinson, requesting that it should be forwarded to the event organiser.

'I see that I was recorded as mis-punching at the event on Sunday, but if you look at the splits you'll see that all the controls are there. The misprinting of controls 3 & 7 on Green meant that I punched 120 as if it were no 3, and 166 as 7. It looks as if this has been corrected in most cases, but there are three people (myself, Jeremy Gray & Simon Clamp) where the correction hasn't worked.' (The implication being that the three competitors should be reinstated)

3.3. Summary of evidence

3.3.1. Paul Lowe did not change anything to do with the order that anyone punched the controls. Peter Waldron, Jeremy Grey and Simon Clamp were the only 3 that did not punch the affected controls (3 and 7) in the correct order. Nine other competitors had wrongly punched 120 as control 3 but then punched 166 straight afterwards. This can be seen in the splits and is recorded as times above the asterisked control number.

- 3.3.2. The physical position of the controls on the ground where correct to the position of the control circles on the map
- 3.3.3. The control descriptions were correct on the control description sheet
- 3.3.4. Control #3 and #7 were correctly numbered 166 and 120
- 3.3.5. The lines on the map joined the circles in the correct sequence.
- 3.3.6. Controls #3 and #7 were located close to one another and they were approximately 50m apart. This is permitted under BOF rule 6.2.4 as they were on differently described features and in different areas of forest;
- control #3; Control number 166, north side of earth wall, 'dark green' forest and
 - control #7; Control number 120; small depression, 'white' forest
- 3.3.7. The control sequence number '3' on the map was next to the control circle for number 7. This was the only misleading factor.



- 3.3.8. Correcting 'problems' during a race is permitted. [BOF Rule 3.3.1/ Para 1) refers]. Therefore the decision by the Controller to inform late starters of the problem was correct. However the remaining maps should have been overwritten with a red pen to correct the error.

3.4. Factors considered

3.4.1. Summary of the results

Of the 32 competitors on the green course, 25 completed the course, 4 mis-punched and 3 retired (one due to injury)

Of the 25 who successfully competed the course;

	Not aware of problem	Aware of problem
Clean run	8	8
Punched #7 first then #3	5	2
Punched #3 and #7 twice	2	

Of the 4 who mis-punched or retired

	Not aware of problem	Aware of problem
Mis-punched	3	1
Retired	2	1

3.4.2. The results were re run with the leg between controls 2 and 3 voided and analysed with respect to the relative finishing positions of the competitors.

4. Conclusions

4.1. Reinstatement of the three competitors who transposed control #3 and 7

The control description sheets and the lines linking the controls were in the correct sequence. The site equipment was correctly marked. The control sites were on differently described features. It is the requirement of the competitors to follow the marked course in the correct sequence and therefore the three competitors (and Alexander Ware who punched 1, 2, 3, 6, 5, 4, 8....) shall not be reinstated. *[BOF rule 6.5.6 refers.]*

4.2. There was a mixed reaction by competitors to the problem as some of the competitors who were advised of the problem still failed to have a 'clean' run. Therefore it cannot be proved that those who started after 11:20 had an advantage over those who were unaware of the problem.

4.3. The purpose of an orienteering event is to determine the best Orienteerer on the day. As it can be shown that the relative positions of the top 5 finishers does not change when the affected leg is voided then the results as published stand. *[BOF Rules/ Appendix I/ 3.1.2 and 3.2.3 refers]*.

4.4. There are no Guidelines for the East Anglian League other than the document on the web site 'How the EAL Works'. <http://www.eaoa.org.uk/league2010/EALrules.htm>. Therefore the BOF Rules apply.

4.5. The relative positions of the finishers for each age group for the purposes of calculating the scores for the East Anglian League did not change. The final results as published shall be used to calculate the scores for the EAL. *[BOF Rule Appendix G/ 3.4.2 refers]*

4.6. Immediate causes

4.6.1. Travellers occupying an element of the competition area

4.6.2. Last minute adjustment of the courses by the Planner to avoid the travellers resulting in the control sequence numbers touching or being close to other control circles on the map

4.7. Root Causes

4.7.1. Lack of 'quality' check by the Planner and /or the Controller meant that the error was not identified before the start of the competition

4.7.2. Competitors not following the controls in the correct sequence by following the joining lines

4.7.3. Competitors not following the correct sequence as per the control description sheet

5. Recommendations

5.1. All Competitors affected on the Green Course at the SUFFOC event at Hurdred Acre Walks on 2nd Oct shall be entitled to free entry to the next SUFFOC event.

5.2. Sufficient time to be factored into the planning of courses to allowed the Planner and the Controller to quality check the overprinting of each course.

5.3. Hard copies of the BOF Rules and Appendices to be available at all future SUFFOC events

5.4. Hard copy of the EAL Rules to be available at all future SUFFOC events

5.5. All competitors familiarise themselves with the BOF rules and relevant Event Guidelines and in particular; Rule 9 'Complaint, Protests and Appeals'

5.6. All competitors should follow the 'Golden rule of orienteering'ONLY GO AS FAST AS YOU CAN READ THE MAP [see <http://myweb.tiscali.co.uk/magnus/orientgoldenrule.html>]

Appendix

Start times. Competitors highlighted were advised of the problem at the start

Name	Age Class	Club	Start	Actual Time		Remarks	Classifier
				Finish	Taken		
Glen Richardson	M21	NOR	11:52:17	12:35:41	0:43:24	Clean Run	
Joanne West	W21	SOS	11:43:25	12:54:32	1:11:07	Clean Run	
Chris Morley	M70	WAOC	10:48:28	12:01:15	1:12:47	Clean Run	
Lindsey Freeman	W55	LOG	10:31:23	11:46:26	1:15:03	Clean Run	
Simon Peck	M55	SUFFOC	09:41:50	10:57:46	1:15:56	Clean Run	
Peter Cheetham	M50	CHIG	10:29:23	11:50:37	1:21:14	Clean Run	
Sarah Mansel	W45	SUFFOC	12:16:39	13:38:18	1:21:39	Clean Run	
Charlotte Cheetham	W50	CHIG	10:27:23	11:52:53	1:25:30	Clean Run	
Peter Waldron	M55	NOR	10:52:25	12:16:36	1:24:11	Transposed 3 & 7	MP
Rhiannon Ware	W16	SOS	11:24:45	12:50:44	1:25:59	Clean Run	
Adam Waller-Toyne	M45	SOS	10:56:31	12:21:53	1:25:22	Clean Run	
Lyn West	W55	SOS	11:40:25	13:18:05	1:37:40	147-120-166-102	
Jillyan Dobby	W60	MDOC	11:13:46	12:39:28	1:25:42	147-120-166-102 & 106-120-166-151	
Richard Barker	M55	SOS	10:39:30	12:09:17	1:29:47	147-120-166-102	
John Collyer	M65	SOS	11:48:25	13:15:49	1:27:24	147-166-120-102	
Alexander Ware	M18	SOS	11:27:33	13:01:00	1:33:27	Transposed 5 & 6	MP
Louise Walker	W45	SUFFOC	10:50:25	12:26:19	1:35:54	147-120-166-102	
Jeremy Gray	M45	SUFFOC	11:00:54	12:36:35	1:35:41	Transposed 3 & 7	MP
Simon Clamp	M50	NONE	10:58:27	12:36:23	1:37:56	Transposed 3 & 7	MP
Mitch Lock	M50	NONE	11:10:33	12:50:19	1:39:46	147-120-166-102	
Graham Ward	M65	NOR	10:21:28	12:27:17	2:05:49	147-120-166-102	
Geraldine Russell	W65	SOS	10:37:23	12:25:31	1:48:08	147-120-166-102 & 106-120-166-151	
Clive Parsons	M50	NOR	12:12:58	14:08:59	1:56:01	Clean Run	
Paul Garton	M60	NOR	12:21:36	14:26:01	2:04:25	Clean Run	
David Skinner	M60	SOS	11:03:30	13:03:33	2:00:03	Clean Run	
Hally Hardie	M70	WAOC	10:20:13	12:20:22	2:00:09	Clean Run	
Julie Laver	W45	SOS	11:50:39	13:59:00	2:08:21	Clean Run	
Rodney Freeburn	M70	NOR	12:27:40	14:38:21	2:10:41	Clean Run	
Estella Ward	W60	NOR	10:19:25	12:35:10	2:15:45	147-120-166-102	
Peter Warland	M45	SOS	10:54:24	12:09:37	1:15:13	Rtd after Ctrl 10	Rtd
Barbara Fothergill	W55	HAVOC	11:12:05	12:57:46	1:45:41	Rtd after Ctrl 9	Rtd
Michael Presland	M60	NOR	12:18:51			Rtd After Ctrl 7	Rtd

Final results as published

Hundred Acre Walks

Sun 02/10/2011

Green (32) 5.7 km 13 C

1 Glen Richardson	M21	NOR	43:24
2 Joanne West	W21	SOS	1:11:07
3 Chris Morley	M70	WAOC	1:12:47
4 Lindsey Freeman	W55	LOG	1:15:03
5 Simon Peck	M55	SUFFOC	1:15:56
6 Peter Cheetham	M50	CHIG	1:21:14
7 Sarah Mansel	W45	SUFFOC	1:21:39
8 Adam Waller-Toyne	M45	SOS	1:25:22
9 Charlotte Cheetham	W50	CHIG	1:25:30
10 Jillyan Dobby	W60	MDOC	1:25:42
11 Rhiannon Ware	W16	SOS	1:25:59
12 John Collyer	M65	SOS	1:27:24
13 Richard Barker	M55	SOS	1:29:47
14 Louise Walker	W45	SUFFOC	1:35:54
15 Lyn West	W55	SOS	1:37:40
16 Mitch Lock	M50	NONE	1:39:46
17 Geraldine Russell	W65	SOS	1:48:08
18 Clive Parsons	M50	NOR	1:56:01
19 David Skinner	M60	SOS	2:00:03
20 Hally Hardie	M70	WAOC	2:00:09
21 Paul Garton	M60	NOR	2:04:25
22 Graham Ward	M65	NOR	2:05:49
23 Julie Laver	W45	SOS	2:08:21
24 Rodney Freeburn	M70	NOR	2:10:41
25 Estella Ward	W60	NOR	2:15:45
Peter Warland	M45	SOS	mp
Peter Waldron	M55	NOR	mp
Barbara Fothergill	W55	HAVOC	mp
Jeremy Gray	M45	SUFFOC	mp
Simon Clamp	M50	NONE	mp
Alexander Ware	M18	SOS	mp
Michael Presland	M60	NOR	mp

Results with leg 2-3 voided

Hundred Acre Walks				Tue 11/10/2011 23:51	
Results		OE2003 © Stephan Krämer 2006		Page 1	
PI	Name	AgeClass	Club	School	Time
Green (32) Voided legs: 1 5.7 km 13 C					
1	Glen Richardson	M21	NOR		40:12
2	Joanne West	W21	SOS		1:04:37
3	Chris Morley	M70	WAOC		1:06:12
4	Lindsey Freeman	W55	LOG		1:09:47
5	Simon Peck	M55	SUFFOC		1:11:14
6	Adam Waller-Toyne	M45	SOS		1:13:33
7	Jillyan Dobby	W60	MDOC		1:13:34
8	Peter Cheetham	M50	CHIG		1:14:57
9	Sarah Mansel	W45	SUFFOC		1:15:20
10	Charlotte Cheetham	W50	CHIG		1:19:14
11	Richard Barker	M55	SOS		1:19:41
12	Louise Walker	W45	SUFFOC		1:19:58
13	John Collyer	M65	SOS		1:20:02
14	Rhiannon Ware	W16	SOS		1:21:37
15	Mitch Lock	M50	NONE		1:27:57
16	Lyn West	W55	SOS		1:29:45
17	Geraldine Russell	W65	SOS		1:36:54
18	Clive Parsons	M50	NOR		1:37:21
19	Hally Hardie	M70	WAOC		1:48:40
20	Graham Ward	M65	NOR		1:51:20
21	David Skinner	M60	SOS		1:54:58
22	Paul Garton	M60	NOR		1:55:21
23	Estella Ward	W60	NOR		1:58:27
24	Julie Laver	W45	SOS		1:59:50
25	Rodney Freeburn	M70	NOR		1:59:54
	Peter Warland	M45	SOS		mp
	Peter Waldron	M55	NOR		mp
	Barbara Fothergill	W55	HAVOC		mp
	Jeremy Gray	M45	SUFFOC		mp
	Simon Clamp	M50	NONE		mp
	Alexander Ware	M18	SOS		mp
	Michael Presland	M60	NOR		mp